

Year **2016**

| Program                            | Tier         | Measure | Units | Measure Life | NTG | Net Annual Savings w/ Line Loss |                   |                    | Costs per Unit Incremental Cost | Total Costs        |                    | B/C Ratio -- Cost Tests |             |             |             |             |
|------------------------------------|--------------|---------|-------|--------------|-----|---------------------------------|-------------------|--------------------|---------------------------------|--------------------|--------------------|-------------------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|
|                                    |              |         |       |              |     | Therm                           | kWh               | Peak Coincident kW |                                 | Total Incentives   | Admin              | TRC                     | RIM         | Utility     | Societal    | Participant |
| <b>Total</b>                       |              |         |       |              |     | <b>96,223</b>                   | <b>17,955,082</b> | <b>5,225</b>       |                                 | <b>\$2,580,493</b> | <b>\$3,379,633</b> | <b>2.77</b>             | <b>1.42</b> | <b>3.81</b> | <b>2.87</b> | <b>3.12</b> |
|                                    |              |         |       |              |     | <b>48,818</b>                   | <b>6,407,449</b>  | <b>1,536</b>       |                                 | <b>\$471,298</b>   | <b>\$856,680</b>   | <b>2.19</b>             | <b>0.95</b> | <b>3.37</b> | <b>2.27</b> | <b>3.65</b> |
| High Efficiency Lighting           |              |         |       |              |     | -                               | 2,992,511         | 345                |                                 | \$317,175          | \$198,843          | 1.37                    | 0.64        | 2.88        | 1.46        | 2.68        |
| Appliance Recycling                |              |         |       |              |     | 587                             | 181,867           | 24                 |                                 | \$8,500            | \$39,255           | 1.57                    | 0.50        | 1.29        | 1.67        | n/a         |
| Appliance Recycling                | App          |         |       |              |     | -                               | 131,131           | 18                 |                                 | \$8,500            | \$30,855           | 1.08                    | 0.48        | 1.09        | 1.15        | 8.49        |
| Appliance Recycling                | Kits         |         |       |              |     | 587                             | 50,736            | 6                  |                                 | \$0                | \$8,400            | 2.21                    | 0.57        | 2.21        | 2.34        | n/a         |
| On-Site Energy Evaluation          |              |         |       |              |     | 48,231                          | 277,504           | 95                 |                                 | \$52,473           | \$261,313          | 1.69                    | 0.70        | 2.15        | 1.72        | 4.80        |
| On-Site Energy Evaluation          | Level 1      |         |       |              |     | 19,869                          | 126,283           | 16                 |                                 | \$0                | \$148,313          | 0.94                    | 0.40        | 0.94        | 0.96        | n/a         |
| On-Site Energy Evaluation          | Level 2      |         |       |              |     | 28,361                          | 151,221           | 79                 |                                 | \$52,473           | \$113,000          | 2.13                    | 0.87        | 3.24        | 2.17        | 3.43        |
| High Efficiency Cooling            |              |         |       |              |     | -                               | 550,248           | 572                |                                 | \$93,150           | \$72,310           | 8.76                    | 2.70        | 11.93       | 8.90        | 6.40        |
| Home Energy Comparison Report      |              |         |       |              |     | -                               | 2,405,318         | 500                |                                 | \$0                | \$284,960          | 0.79                    | 0.44        | 0.79        | 0.84        | n/a         |
| Online Home Energy Evaluation      |              |         |       |              |     | -                               | -                 | -                  |                                 | \$0                | \$0                | n/a                     | n/a         | n/a         | n/a         | n/a         |
|                                    |              |         |       |              |     | <b>(6,098)</b>                  | <b>9,462,706</b>  | <b>2,675</b>       |                                 | <b>\$2,109,195</b> | <b>\$836,112</b>   | <b>3.30</b>             | <b>1.51</b> | <b>4.99</b> | <b>3.43</b> | <b>2.53</b> |
| C&I New Construction               |              |         |       |              |     | -                               | 152,635           | 43                 |                                 | \$15,300           | \$31,989           | 3.47                    | 1.54        | 5.38        | 3.61        | 3.34        |
| C&I Custom                         |              |         |       |              |     | -                               | 2,011,121         | 339                |                                 | \$551,000          | \$81,130           | 2.65                    | 1.17        | 4.04        | 2.79        | 2.68        |
| C&I Self Direct                    |              |         |       |              |     | -                               | 105,848           | 18                 |                                 | \$31,900           | \$1,370            | 2.81                    | 1.17        | 4.04        | 2.96        | 2.75        |
| C&I Prescriptive                   |              |         |       |              |     | -                               | 290,674           | 250                |                                 | \$124,770          | \$23,120           | 2.85                    | 2.98        | 6.41        | 2.89        | 1.05        |
| C&I Lighting                       |              |         |       |              |     | (6,098)                         | 6,902,428         | 2,025              |                                 | \$1,386,225        | \$698,503          | 3.56                    | 1.55        | 5.18        | 3.70        | 2.64        |
| C&I Lighting                       | Prescriptive |         |       |              |     | (6,098)                         | 1,566,730         | 435                |                                 | \$263,025          | \$77,318           | 2.89                    | 1.45        | 4.76        | 3.02        | 2.44        |
| C&I Lighting                       | SBDI         |         |       |              |     | -                               | 5,335,698         | 1,591              |                                 | \$1,123,200        | \$621,185          | 3.71                    | 1.57        | 5.26        | 3.85        | 2.70        |
|                                    |              |         |       |              |     | <b>53,502</b>                   | <b>2,084,927</b>  | <b>1,014</b>       |                                 | <b>\$0</b>         | <b>\$1,028,026</b> | <b>3.41</b>             | <b>1.72</b> | <b>3.41</b> | <b>3.48</b> | <b>n/a</b>  |
| Low-Income Assistance              |              |         |       |              |     | 20,070                          | 930,708           | 882                |                                 | \$0                | \$840,776          | 3.67                    | 1.67        | 3.67        | 3.73        | n/a         |
| Low-Income Assistance              | Non-Kit      |         |       |              |     | -                               | 797,311           | 865                |                                 | \$0                | \$692,463          | 4.25                    | 1.96        | 4.25        | 4.31        | n/a         |
| Low-Income Assistance              | Kit          |         |       |              |     | 20,070                          | 133,396           | 17                 |                                 | \$0                | \$148,313          | 0.96                    | 0.41        | 0.96        | 0.99        | n/a         |
| School Based Energy Education      |              |         |       |              |     | 13,362                          | 1,154,219         | 132                |                                 | \$0                | \$187,250          | 2.25                    | 0.58        | 2.25        | 2.39        | n/a         |
| <b>General Administration</b>      |              |         |       |              |     |                                 |                   |                    |                                 | <b>\$0</b>         | <b>\$187,500</b>   |                         |             |             |             | <b>n/a</b>  |
| <b>General Marketing/Education</b> |              |         |       |              |     |                                 |                   |                    |                                 | <b>\$0</b>         | <b>\$187,500</b>   |                         |             |             |             | <b>n/a</b>  |
| <b>Evaluation</b>                  |              |         |       |              |     |                                 |                   |                    |                                 | <b>\$0</b>         | <b>\$283,816</b>   |                         |             |             |             | <b>n/a</b>  |

Year 2017

| Program                       | Tier         | Measure | Units | Measure Life | Net Annual Savings with Line Losses |                |                   | Total Costs        |                    | B/C Ratio -- Cost Tests |             |             |             |             |             |
|-------------------------------|--------------|---------|-------|--------------|-------------------------------------|----------------|-------------------|--------------------|--------------------|-------------------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|
|                               |              |         |       |              | NTG                                 | Therm          | kWh               | Peak Coincident kW | Incentives         | Admin                   | TRC         | RIM         | Utility     | Societal    | Participant |
| <b>Total</b>                  |              |         |       |              |                                     | <b>79,683</b>  | <b>19,768,870</b> | <b>5,599</b>       | <b>\$2,756,772</b> | <b>\$3,420,258</b>      | <b>2.90</b> | <b>1.45</b> | <b>4.01</b> | <b>3.00</b> | <b>3.17</b> |
|                               |              |         |       |              |                                     | <b>52,870</b>  | <b>7,574,675</b>  | <b>1,751</b>       | <b>\$508,037</b>   | <b>\$845,469</b>        | <b>2.35</b> | <b>0.98</b> | <b>3.70</b> | <b>2.43</b> | <b>3.71</b> |
| High Efficiency Lighting      |              |         |       |              |                                     | -              | 3,115,404         | 359                | \$336,175          | \$205,353               | 1.43        | 0.66        | 3.03        | 1.52        | 2.68        |
| Appliance Recycling           |              |         |       |              |                                     | -              | 214,427           | 27                 | \$10,000           | \$46,200                | 1.65        | 0.52        | 1.36        | 1.75        | n/a         |
| Appliance Recycling           | App          |         |       |              |                                     | -              | 154,631           | 21                 | \$10,000           | \$36,300                | 1.14        | 0.63        | 1.15        | 1.21        | 8.69        |
| Appliance Recycling           | Kits         |         |       |              |                                     | 692            | 59,796            | 7                  | \$0                | \$9,900                 | 2.33        | 0.81        | 2.33        | 2.47        | n/a         |
| On-Site Energy Evaluation     |              |         |       |              |                                     | 52,870         | 306,857           | 105                | \$57,462           | \$287,444               | 1.75        | 0.71        | 2.22        | 1.78        | 4.93        |
| On-Site Energy Evaluation     | Level 1      |         |       |              |                                     | 21,856         | 138,911           | 18                 | \$0                | \$163,144               | 0.97        | 0.41        | 0.97        | 1.00        | n/a         |
| On-Site Energy Evaluation     | Level 2      |         |       |              |                                     | 31,014         | 167,945           | 87                 | \$57,462           | \$124,300               | 2.20        | 0.88        | 3.35        | 2.24        | 3.52        |
| High Efficiency Cooling       |              |         |       |              |                                     | -              | 579,259           | 600                | \$104,400          | \$77,672                | 8.30        | 2.69        | 11.71       | 8.42        | 5.92        |
| Home Energy Comparison Report |              |         |       |              |                                     | -              | 3,358,728         | 660                | \$0                | \$228,800               | 1.40        | 0.58        | 1.40        | 1.48        | n/a         |
| Online Home Energy Evaluation |              |         |       |              |                                     | -              | -                 | -                  | \$0                | \$0                     | n/a         | n/a         | n/a         | n/a         | n/a         |
|                               |              |         |       |              |                                     | <b>(6,619)</b> | <b>10,050,811</b> | <b>2,828</b>       | <b>\$2,248,735</b> | <b>\$877,619</b>        | <b>3.41</b> | <b>1.53</b> | <b>5.16</b> | <b>3.55</b> | <b>2.58</b> |
| C&I New Construction          |              |         |       |              |                                     | -              | 152,635           | 43                 | \$15,300           | \$31,989                | 3.60        | 1.57        | 5.58        | 3.74        | 3.41        |
| C&I Custom                    |              |         |       |              |                                     | -              | 2,275,742         | 384                | \$623,500          | \$91,805                | 2.76        | 1.20        | 4.20        | 2.90        | 2.74        |
| C&I Self Direct               |              |         |       |              |                                     | -              | 105,848           | 18                 | \$31,900           | \$1,370                 | 2.93        | 1.20        | 4.20        | 3.08        | 2.80        |
| C&I Prescriptive              |              |         |       |              |                                     | -              | 298,701           | 266                | \$130,520          | \$24,328                | 3.00        | 3.08        | 6.66        | 3.04        | 1.07        |
| C&I Lighting                  |              |         |       |              |                                     | (6,619)        | 7,217,885         | 2,117              | \$1,447,515        | \$728,128               | 3.69        | 1.58        | 5.37        | 3.83        | 2.70        |
| C&I Lighting                  | Prescriptive |         |       |              |                                     | (6,619)        | 1,690,649         | 470                | \$283,995          | \$84,644                | 3.04        | 1.48        | 4.95        | 3.17        | 2.51        |
| C&I Lighting                  | SBDI         |         |       |              |                                     | -              | 5,527,236         | 1,648              | \$1,163,520        | \$643,484               | 3.84        | 1.60        | 5.46        | 3.99        | 2.75        |
|                               |              |         |       |              |                                     | <b>33,432</b>  | <b>2,143,384</b>  | <b>1,020</b>       | <b>\$0</b>         | <b>\$1,028,026</b>      | <b>3.56</b> | <b>1.75</b> | <b>3.56</b> | <b>3.64</b> | <b>n/a</b>  |
| Low-Income Assistance         |              |         |       |              |                                     | -              | -                 | -                  | \$0                | \$840,776               | 3.83        | 1.67        | 3.83        | 3.89        | n/a         |
| Low-Income Assistance         | Non-Kit      |         |       |              |                                     | -              | 855,768           | 872                | \$0                | \$692,463               | 4.43        | 1.96        | 4.43        | 4.50        | n/a         |
| Low-Income Assistance         | Kit          |         |       |              |                                     | 20,070         | 133,396           | 17                 | \$0                | \$148,313               | 0.99        | 0.42        | 0.99        | 1.02        | n/a         |
| School Based Energy Education |              |         |       |              |                                     | 13,362         | 1,154,219         | 132                | \$0                | \$187,250               | 2.38        | 0.60        | 2.38        | 2.52        | n/a         |
| General Administration        |              |         |       |              |                                     | -              | -                 | -                  | \$0                | \$187,500               | -           | -           | -           | -           | n/a         |
| General Marketing/Education   |              |         |       |              |                                     | -              | -                 | -                  | \$0                | \$187,500               | -           | -           | -           | -           | n/a         |
| Evaluation                    |              |         |       |              |                                     | -              | -                 | -                  | \$0                | \$294,144               | -           | -           | -           | -           | n/a         |

## Appendix A - Detailed Benefit-Cost Analysis Results

Year 2018

| Program                            | Tier         | Net Annual Savings with Line Losses |                   |                    | Total Costs        |                    | B/C Ratio -- Cost Tests |             |             |             |             |
|------------------------------------|--------------|-------------------------------------|-------------------|--------------------|--------------------|--------------------|-------------------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|
|                                    |              | Therm                               | kWh               | Peak Coincident kW | Total Incentives   | Admin              | TRC                     | RIM         | Utility     | Societal    | Participant |
| <b>Total</b>                       |              | <b>84,358</b>                       | <b>20,632,820</b> | <b>5,818</b>       | <b>\$2,932,659</b> | <b>\$3,553,593</b> | <b>2.98</b>             | <b>1.47</b> | <b>4.14</b> | <b>3.08</b> | <b>3.19</b> |
|                                    |              | <b>57,950</b>                       | <b>7,865,243</b>  | <b>1,814</b>       | <b>\$543,034</b>   | <b>\$889,958</b>   | <b>2.41</b>             | <b>0.99</b> | <b>3.83</b> | <b>2.50</b> | <b>3.72</b> |
| High Efficiency Lighting           |              | -                                   | 3,238,296         | 374                | \$355,175          | \$211,863          | 1.48                    | 0.68        | 3.18        | 1.57        | 2.70        |
| Appliance Recycling                |              | -                                   | 246,988           | 31                 | \$11,500           | \$53,145           | 1.74                    | 0.54        | 1.43        | 1.84        | n/a         |
| Appliance Recycling                | App          | -                                   | 178,132           | 23                 | \$11,500           | \$41,745           | 1.20                    | 0.65        | 1.21        | 1.27        | 8.89        |
| Appliance Recycling                | Kits         | 797                                 | 68,856            | 8                  | \$0                | \$11,400           | 2.45                    | 0.84        | 2.45        | 2.60        | n/a         |
| On-Site Energy Evaluation          |              | 57,950                              | 331,971           | 114                | \$62,709           | \$313,575          | 1.79                    | 0.72        | 2.28        | 1.83        | 5.03        |
| On-Site Energy Evaluation          | Level 1      | 23,843                              | 151,540           | 19                 | \$0                | \$177,975          | 1.00                    | 0.42        | 1.00        | 1.03        | n/a         |
| On-Site Energy Evaluation          | Level 2      | 34,107                              | 180,431           | 94                 | \$62,709           | \$135,600          | 2.26                    | 0.89        | 3.42        | 2.29        | 3.59        |
| High Efficiency Cooling            |              | -                                   | 606,553           | 625                | \$113,650          | \$82,575           | 8.08                    | 2.68        | 11.67       | 8.21        | 5.69        |
| Home Energy Comparison Report      |              | -                                   | 3,441,436         | 671                | \$0                | \$228,800          | 1.53                    | 0.62        | 1.53        | 1.61        | n/a         |
| Online Home Energy Evaluation      |              | -                                   | -                 | -                  | \$0                | \$0                | n/a                     | n/a         | n/a         | n/a         | n/a         |
|                                    |              | <b>(7,025)</b>                      | <b>10,624,193</b> | <b>2,983</b>       | <b>\$2,389,625</b> | <b>\$913,646</b>   | <b>3.52</b>             | <b>1.56</b> | <b>5.33</b> | <b>3.65</b> | <b>2.62</b> |
| C&I New Construction               |              | -                                   | 152,635           | 43                 | \$15,300           | \$31,989           | 3.73                    | 1.60        | 5.78        | 3.87        | 3.49        |
| C&I Custom                         |              | -                                   | 2,540,363         | 428                | \$696,000          | \$102,480          | 2.87                    | 1.22        | 4.37        | 3.01        | 2.79        |
| C&I Self Direct                    |              | -                                   | 105,848           | 18                 | \$31,900           | \$1,370            | 3.04                    | 1.22        | 4.37        | 3.19        | 2.85        |
| C&I Prescriptive                   |              | -                                   | 339,342           | 296                | \$147,635          | \$27,243           | 3.00                    | 3.10        | 6.73        | 3.05        | 1.07        |
| C&I Lighting                       |              | (7,025)                             | 7,486,004         | 2,198              | \$1,498,790        | \$750,564          | 3.82                    | 1.61        | 5.57        | 3.97        | 2.75        |
| C&I Lighting                       | Prescriptive | (7,025)                             | 1,794,594         | 502                | \$300,710          | \$87,967           | 3.17                    | 1.52        | 5.18        | 3.30        | 2.55        |
| C&I Lighting                       | SBDI         | -                                   | 5,691,411         | 1,697              | \$1,198,080        | \$662,597          | 3.98                    | 1.63        | 5.65        | 4.13        | 2.80        |
|                                    |              | <b>33,432</b>                       | <b>2,143,384</b>  | <b>1,020</b>       | <b>\$0</b>         | <b>\$1,028,026</b> | <b>3.68</b>             | <b>1.78</b> | <b>3.68</b> | <b>3.76</b> | <b>n/a</b>  |
| Low-Income Assistance              |              | -                                   | -                 | -                  | \$0                | \$840,776          | 3.94                    | 1.70        | 3.94        | 4.00        | n/a         |
| Low-Income Assistance              | Non-Kit      | -                                   | 855,768           | 872                | \$0                | \$692,463          | 4.56                    | 1.99        | 4.56        | 4.63        | n/a         |
| Low-Income Assistance              | Kit          | 20,070                              | 133,396           | 17                 | \$0                | \$148,313          | 1.03                    | 0.42        | 1.03        | 1.06        | n/a         |
| School Based Energy Education      |              | 13,362                              | 1,154,219         | 132                | \$0                | \$187,250          | 2.50                    | 0.62        | 2.50        | 2.65        | n/a         |
| <b>General Administration</b>      |              |                                     |                   |                    | <b>\$0</b>         | <b>\$187,500</b>   |                         |             |             |             | n/a         |
| <b>General Marketing/Education</b> |              |                                     |                   |                    | <b>\$0</b>         | <b>\$187,500</b>   |                         |             |             |             | n/a         |
| <b>Evaluation</b>                  |              |                                     |                   |                    | <b>\$0</b>         | <b>\$346,964</b>   |                         |             |             |             | n/a         |

## Appendix A - Detailed Benefit-Cost Analysis Results

|                                    |              | 2016 - 2018 B/C Ratio -- Cost Tests |             |             |             |             |
|------------------------------------|--------------|-------------------------------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|
| Program                            | Tier         | TRC                                 | RIM         | Utility     | Societal    | Participant |
| <b>Total</b>                       |              | <b>2.88</b>                         | <b>1.45</b> | <b>3.98</b> | <b>2.98</b> | <b>3.16</b> |
|                                    |              | 2.32                                | 0.97        | 3.63        | 2.40        | 3.69        |
| High Efficiency Lighting           |              | 1.42                                | 0.66        | 3.03        | 1.51        | 2.68        |
| Appliance Recycling                |              | 1.66                                | 0.52        | 1.36        | 1.76        | n/a         |
| Appliance Recycling                | App          | 1.14                                | 0.58        | 1.15        | 1.21        | 8.70        |
| Appliance Recycling                | Kits         | 2.34                                | 0.73        | 2.34        | 2.48        | n/a         |
| On-Site Energy Evaluation          |              | 1.74                                | 0.71        | 2.22        | 1.78        | 4.92        |
| On-Site Energy Evaluation          | Level 1      | 0.97                                | 0.41        | 0.97        | 1.00        | n/a         |
| On-Site Energy Evaluation          | Level 2      | 2.20                                | 0.88        | 3.34        | 2.24        | 3.52        |
| High Efficiency Cooling            |              | 8.37                                | 2.69        | 11.77       | 8.50        | 5.99        |
| Home Energy Comparison Report      |              | 1.19                                | 0.55        | 1.19        | 1.25        | n/a         |
| Online Home Energy Evaluation      |              | n/a                                 | n/a         | n/a         | n/a         | n/a         |
|                                    |              | 3.41                                | 1.53        | 5.16        | 3.54        | 2.58        |
| C&I New Construction               |              | 3.59                                | 1.57        | 5.57        | 3.73        | 3.41        |
| C&I Custom                         |              | 2.76                                | 1.20        | 4.21        | 2.90        | 2.74        |
| C&I Self Direct                    |              | 2.92                                | 1.20        | 4.19        | 3.07        | 2.80        |
| C&I Prescriptive                   |              | 2.95                                | 3.05        | 6.60        | 2.99        | 1.06        |
| C&I Lighting                       |              | 3.69                                | 1.58        | 5.37        | 3.83        | 2.70        |
| C&I Lighting                       | Prescriptive | 3.03                                | 1.49        | 4.96        | 3.16        | 2.50        |
| C&I Lighting                       | SBDI         | 3.84                                | 1.60        | 5.45        | 3.98        | 2.75        |
|                                    |              | 3.54                                | 1.75        | 3.54        | 3.62        | n/a         |
| Low-Income Assistance              |              | 3.81                                | 1.68        | 3.81        | 3.87        | n/a         |
| Low-Income Assistance              | Non-Kit      | 4.41                                | 1.97        | 4.41        | 4.48        | n/a         |
| Low-Income Assistance              | Kit          | 0.99                                | 0.42        | 0.99        | 1.02        | n/a         |
| School Based Energy Education      |              | 2.37                                | 0.60        | 2.37        | 2.52        | n/a         |
| <b>General Administration</b>      |              | -                                   | -           | -           | -           | n/a         |
| <b>General Marketing/Education</b> |              | -                                   | -           | -           | -           | n/a         |
| <b>Evaluation</b>                  |              | -                                   | -           | -           | -           | n/a         |