

BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF COLORADO

PROCEEDING NO. 14A-0550BP-Extension

IN THE MATTER OF THE APPLICATION OF CARING HANDS TRANSPORTATION LLC,
FOR AUTHORITY TO EXTEND OPERATIONS UNDER CONTRACT CARRIER PERMIT
NO. B-10009.

**RECOMMENDED DECISION OF
ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE
ROBERT I. GARVEY
ACCEPTING STIPULATION; DISMISSING
INTERVENTION; GRANTING
APPLICATION AMENDED UNDER MODIFIED
PROCEDURE; AND CLOSING PROCEEDING**

Mailed Date: September 16, 2014

I. STATEMENT

1. On May 29, 2014, Caring Hands Transportation, LLC (Caring Hands or Applicant) filed an Application for New Permanent Authority to Extend Current Authority (Application). Caring Hands requested an extension of operations under its Permit No. B-10009. That filing commenced this proceeding

2. On May 30, 2014 and June 2, 2014, the Applicant filed supplements to the application.

3. On June 2, 2014, the Commission issued notice of the Application as follows:

The proposed extension to Contract Carrier Permit No. B-10009 reads as follows:

For authority to operate as a contract carrier by motor vehicle for hire for the transportation of

passengers

between all points in the Counties of Adams, Arapahoe, Boulder, Broomfield, Denver, Douglas, and Jefferson, State of Colorado.

RESTRICTIONS: This application is restricted:

- (A) to the transportation of passengers who are recipients of Medicaid;
- (B) to providing Non-Emergency Medical Transportation (NEMT) services for the Colorado Department of Health Care Policy and Financing, 1570 Grant Street; Denver, Colorado; and,
- (C) against providing transportation service to and from Denver International Airport, hotels, and motels.

4. On June 5, 2014, MKBS, LLC, doing business as Metro Taxi and/or Taxis Fiesta and/or South Suburban Taxi (Metro Taxi) filed their Entry of Appearance and Notice of Intervention of Right through counsel. This filing attached Commission Authority No. 1481 held by Metro Taxi and a preliminary list of witnesses and exhibits

5. On June 24, 2014, the Applicant filed an amendment the application. Under the amendment the authority if granted would read:

For authority to operate as a contract carrier by motor vehicle for hire for the transportation of passengers

between all points in the Counties of Adams, Arapahoe, Boulder, Broomfield, Denver, Douglas, and Jefferson, State of Colorado.

RESTRICTIONS:

- (A) to the transportation of passengers who are recipients of Medicaid;
- (B) to providing Non-Medical Transportation (NMT) and Non-Emergency Medical Transportation (NEMT) services for the Colorado Department of Health Care Policy and Financing, 1570 Grant Street; Denver, Colorado;
- (C) against providing service to and from Denver International Airport, hotels, and motels;
- (D) to the usage of no more than four vehicles at one time
- (E) against the use of no more than two vehicles at one time for NMT service; and
- (F) against the use of no more than two vehicles at one time for NEMT service.

6. On June 24, 2014, Metro Taxi filed its Withdrawal of Intervention.

7. On July 2, 2014, Colorado Cab Company LLC, doing business as Denver Yellow Cab and Boulder Yellow Cab (Colorado Cab) and Colorado Springs Transportation (Springs), timely intervened of right.

8. On July 14, 2014, the Commission re-issued notice of the Application with the new amendment.

9. On August 7, 2014, Applicant, Colorado Cab, and Springs filed their Stipulation, Motion for Approval of Restrictive Amendment and Motion for Conditional Withdrawal of Interventions. Under the parties' agreement, the restrictively amended authority would read:

For authority to operate as a contract carrier by motor vehicle for hire for the transportation of passengers

between all points in the Counties of Adams, Arapahoe, Denver, Douglas, and Jefferson, State of Colorado.

RESTRICTIONS: This application is restricted:

- (A) to the transportation of passengers who are recipients of Medicaid;
- (B) to providing Non-Medical Transportation (NMT) and Non-Emergency Medical Transportation (NEMT) services for the Colorado Department of Health Care Policy and Financing, 1570 Grant Street; Denver, Colorado;
- (C) against providing service to and from Denver International Airport, hotels, and motels;
- (D) against the provision of service in Douglas County south of a line beginning on the Douglas/Jefferson border to a point on the Douglas/Elbert boundary, this line being parallel to an east-west line drawn through exit 172 of Interstate 25; and,
- (E) against the use of more than three vehicles at any one time.

10. On August 20, 2014, the Commission deemed the application complete and it was referred to an Administrative Law Judge (ALJ).

11. On September 10, 2014, Colorado Cab and Springs filed its Motion for Conditional Withdrawal of Intervention (Motion). In its Motion Colorado Cab and Springs state that the amendment filed on August 7, 2014 is not restrictive and would therefore have to be re-noticed. To make the amendment restrictive Colorado Cab proposes the authority read as follows:

For authority to operate as a contract carrier by motor vehicle for hire for the transportation of

passengers

between all points in the Counties of Adams, Arapahoe, Denver, Douglas, and Jefferson, State of Colorado.

RESTRICTIONS:

- (A) to the transportation of passengers who are recipients of Medicaid;
- (B) to providing Non-Medical Transportation (NMT) and Non-Emergency Medical Transportation (NEMT) services for the Colorado Department of Health Care Policy and Financing, 1570 Grant Street; Denver, Colorado;
- (C) against providing service to and from Denver International Airport, hotels, and motels;
- (D) to the usage of no more than four vehicles at onetime;
- (E) against the use of no more than two vehicles at onetime for NMT service;
- (F) against the use of no more than two vehicles at one time for NEMT service; and,
- (G) against the provision of service in Douglas County south of a line beginning on the Douglas/Jefferson border to a point on the Douglas/Elbert boundary, this line being parallel to an east-west line drawn through exit 172 of Interstate 25.

12. To be acceptable, restrictions must be restrictive in nature, clear and understandable, and administratively enforceable. Both the authority and any restriction on that authority must be unambiguous and must be contained wholly within the permit. Both must be worded so that a person will know, from reading the permit and without having to resort to any other document, the exact extent of the authority and of each restriction.

Clarity is essential because the scope of an authority must be found within the four corners of the permit, which is the touchstone by which one determines whether the operation of a contract carrier is within the scope of its Commission-granted authority. The proposed amendment to the Application meets these standards.

13. The ALJ finds and concludes that the proposed amendment is restrictive in nature, is clear and understandable, and is administratively enforceable.

14. The restriction to the authority sought by Applicant (*i.e.*, the amendment to the Application) will be accepted.

15. Accepting the amendments to the Application has two impacts. First, the authority sought will be amended to conform to the restrictive amendment. Second, the intervention of the Intervenors will be withdrawn.

16. Withdrawal of the intervention and dismissal of the Intervenors leaves the Application, as amended, uncontested. Pursuant to § 40-6-109(5), C.R.S., and Rule 1403 of the Rules of Practice and Procedure, 4 *Code of Colorado Regulations* (CCR) 723-1, the uncontested application may be processed under the modified procedure, without a formal hearing.

17. In accordance with § 40-6-109, C.R.S., the ALJ now transmits to the Commission the record in this proceeding along with a written recommended decision.

II. FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS

18. Applicant is a Colorado limited liability company in good standing.

19. Applicant requests authority to extend operations as a contract carrier. By the Application, Caring Hands LLC, seeks an extension of Permit No. B-10009 to operate as a contract carrier by motor vehicle for hire:

For the transportation of
passengers

between all points in the Counties of Adams, Arapahoe, Denver, Douglas, and Jefferson, State of Colorado.

RESTRICTIONS:

- (A) to the transportation of passengers who are recipients of Medicaid;
- (B) to providing Non-Medical Transportation (NMT) and Non-Emergency Medical Transportation (NEMT) services for the Colorado Department of Health Care Policy and Financing, 1570 Grant Street; Denver, Colorado;
- (C) against providing service to and from Denver International Airport, hotels, and motels;
- (D) to the usage of no more than four vehicles at onetime;
- (E) against the use of no more than two vehicles at onetime for NMT service;
- (F) against the use of no more than two vehicles at one time for NEMT service; and,
- (G) against the provision of service in Douglas County south of a line beginning on the Douglas/Jefferson border to a point on the Douglas/Elbert boundary, this line being parallel to an east-west line drawn through exit 172 of Interstate 25.

20. The verified Application establishes that Applicant is familiar with the Rules Regulating Transportation by Motor Vehicle, 4 CCR 723-6, and agrees to be bound by, and to comply with, those rules. The verified Application and its supporting documentation establish that Applicant has sufficient equipment with which to render the proposed service and is financially fit to conduct operations under the authority requested. In addition, the verified Application establishes that the service proposed is specialized and tailored to meet the customer's distinct needs. Finally, review of the verified Application indicates a need for the

proposed service. Therefore, because the Applicant is fit, financially and otherwise, to perform the proposed service and because the other prerequisites have been met, the permit should be granted.

21. In accordance with § 40-6-109, C.R.S., the ALJ recommends that the Commission enter the following order.

III. ORDER

A. The Commission Orders That:

1. The Joint Motion for Approval of Restrictive Amendments, Conditional Withdrawal of Intervention as amended on September 10, 2014, is granted.

2. The verified Application for an Extension of Permit No. B-10009 as a Contract Carrier of Passengers by Motor Vehicle is amended consistent with the discussion above.

3. The intervention filed by Colorado Cab Company LLC, doing business as Denver Yellow Cab and Boulder Yellow Cab and Colorado Springs Transportation are dismissed from the proceeding.

4. The Application to Extend Operations Under Permit No. B-10009 as a Contract Carrier of Passengers by Motor Vehicle filed by Caring Hands Transportation LLC, as that application has been amended, is granted.

5. Caring Hands Transportation LLC, is granted authority to extend operations as a contract carrier by motor vehicle for hire as follows:

For the transportation of
passengers

between all points in the Counties of Adams, Arapahoe, Denver, Douglas, and Jefferson, State of Colorado.

RESTRICTIONS:

- (A) to the transportation of passengers who are recipients of Medicaid;
- (B) to providing Non-Medical Transportation (NMT) and Non-Emergency Medical Transportation (NEMT) services for the Colorado Department of Health Care Policy and Financing, 1570 Grant Street, Denver, Colorado;
- (C) against providing service to and from Denver International Airport, hotels, and motels;
- (D) to the usage of no more than four vehicles at onetime;
- (E) against the use of no more than two vehicles at onetime for NMT service;
- (F) against the use of no more than two vehicles at one time for NEMT service; and,
- (G) against the provision of service in Douglas County south of a line beginning on the Douglas/Jefferson border to a point on the Douglas/Elbert boundary, this line being parallel to an east-west line drawn through exit 172 of Interstate 25.

6. Caring Hands Transportation, LLC shall operate in accordance with all applicable Colorado laws and Commission rules.

7. Caring Hands Transportation, LLC shall not commence operation until it has complied with the requirements of Colorado laws and Commission rules, including without limitation:

- (a) causing proof of insurance (Form E or self-insurance) or surety bond (Form G) coverage to be filed with the Commission;
- (b) paying to the Commission, the motor vehicle fee (\$5) for each vehicle to be operated under authority granted by the Commission, or in lieu thereof, paid the fee for such vehicle(s) pursuant to the Unified Carrier Registration Agreement;
- (c) having an effective tariff on file with the Commission. Caring Hands Transportation, LLC shall file an advice letter and tariff on not less than ten days' notice. The advice letter and tariff shall be filed as a new Advice Letter proceeding and shall comply with all applicable rules. In calculating the proposed effective date, the date received at the Commission is not included in the notice period and the entire notice period must expire prior to the effective date. (Additional

tariff information can be found on the Commission's website at dora.colorado.gov/puc and by following the transportation common and contract carrier links to tariffs); and

(d) paying the applicable issuance fee (\$5).

8. If Caring Hands Transportation LLC, does not cause proof of insurance or surety bond to be filed, pay the appropriate motor vehicle fees, file an advice letter and proposed tariff, and pay the issuance fee within 60 days of the effective date of this Decision, then the grant of the Permit shall be void. For good cause shown, the Commission may grant additional time for compliance if the request for additional time is filed within 60 days of the effective date of this Decision.

9. The Commission will notify Caring Hands Transportation LLC in writing when the Commission's records demonstrate compliance with paragraph 7.

10. Proceeding No. 14A-0550BP-Extension is closed.

11. This Recommended Decision shall be effective on the day it becomes the Decision of the Commission, if that is the case, and is entered as of the date above.

12. As provided by § 40-6-106, C.R.S., copies of this Recommended Decision shall be served upon the parties, who may file exceptions to it.

a) If no exceptions are filed within 20 days after service or within any extended period of time authorized, or unless the recommended decision is stayed by the Commission upon its own motion, the recommended decision shall become the decision of the Commission and subject to the provisions of § 40-6-114, C.R.S.

b) If a party seeks to amend, modify, annul, or reverse a basic finding of fact in its exceptions, that party must request and pay for a transcript to be filed, or the parties may

stipulate to portions of the transcript according to the procedure stated in § 40-6-113, C.R.S. If no transcript or stipulation is filed, the Commission is bound by the facts set out by the administrative law judge; and the parties cannot challenge these facts. This will limit what the Commission can review if exceptions are filed.

13. If exceptions to this Recommended Decision are filed, they shall not exceed 30 pages in length, unless the Commission for good cause shown permits this limit to be exceeded.

(S E A L)



ATTEST: A TRUE COPY

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Doug Dean".

Doug Dean,
Director

THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION
OF THE STATE OF COLORADO

ROBERT I. GARVEY

Administrative Law Judge