## BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF COLORADO

\* \* \* \* \*

IN THE MATTER OF THE APPLICATION OF PUBLIC SERVICE COMPANY OF COLORADO FOR APPROVAL OF ITS ELECTRIC AND NATURAL GAS DEMAND-SIDE MANAGEMENT (DSM) PLAN FOR CALENDAR YEARS 2012 AND 2013 AND TO CHANGE ITS ELECTRIC AND GAS DSM COST ADJUSTMENT RATES EFFECTIVE JANUARY 1, 2012

**DOCKET NO. 11A-631EG** 

#### STIPULATION AND SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT

### I. INTRODUCTION

Public Service Company of Colorado, for itself and on behalf of the Staff of the Commission ("Trial Staff"), the Colorado Office of Consumer Counsel ("OCC"), the City of Boulder, Boulder County, the Governor's Energy Office ("GEO"), the Southwest Energy Efficiency Project ("SWEEP"), the Colorado Solar Energy Industries Association ("CoSEIA"), the Colorado Renewable Energy Society ("CRES"), Western Resource Advocates ("WRA") the Energy Efficiency Business Coalition ("EEBC"), and EnerNoc, Inc. ("EnerNoc"), collectively referred to as the "Settling Parties", hereby enter into this Stipulation and Settlement Agreement ("Stipulation") resolving, as between these Parties, all issues that have been raised by the Company's 2012-13 DSM plan filling in Docket No. 11A-631EG. This Stipulation sets forth all the terms and conditions of such settlement. The following parties agree not to oppose the Stipulation: Colorado Energy Consumers ("CEC"), Noble Energy, Inc. ("Noble"), and EnCana Oil & Gas (USA)("EnCana").

The Parties to this Stipulation state that the results of the compromises reflected herein are a just and reasonable resolution of the issues addressed in this Stipulation, and that reaching agreement as set forth herein by means of a negotiated settlement is in the public interest. Each Party hereto pledges its support of this Stipulation and states that each will defend the settlement reached. The Parties respectfully request that the Public Utilities Commission of the State of Colorado ("Commission" or "CPUC") approve this Stipulation.

#### II. BACKGROUND

On August 1, 2011, Public Service filed its Application For Approval Of Its Electric And Natural Gas Demand-Side Management Plan For Calendar Years 2012 And 2013 And To Change Its Electric And Gas DSM Cost Adjustment Rates Effective January 1, 2012. On September 8, 2008, the ALJ issued Decision No. R11-0965-I establishing pre-filing deadlines and setting this case for two days of hearings commencing on November 17, 2011.

Public Service's 2012-2013 DSM Biennial Plan is a combined electric and natural gas DSM plan under which the Company proposes to offer a variety of direct and indirect impact DSM programs targeted to residential, business and low-income customer classes over the course of two years. The Company's plan also includes a Planning and Research component consisting of: DSM Market Research; DSM Planning and Administration; DSM Product Development; and Evaluation, Measurement and Verification. As originally filed the Company's proposed plan was designed to achieve approximately 330.5 GWh and 356 GWh in electric energy savings, respectively and 97 MW and 89.2 MW in demand reduction, at a proposed cost of \$76

million and \$86 million for 2012 and 2013, respectively. The Company also filed Gas DSM Savings plans designed to save 413,471 dekatherms in 2012 and 406,727 dekatherms in 2013 at a cost of \$12.6 million and \$12.7 million, respectively. This Stipulation amends various aspects of the Plans as filed resulting in amended savings targets and budgets as set forth Sections 4, 9 and 11, below.

The Settling Parties recommend that the Commission authorize the Company to implement the DSM plan as amended by the Stipulation.

#### III. TERMS OF SETTLEMENT

The Settling Parties hereby stipulate and agree as follows:

1. The 2012-13 DSM Plan. The Settling Parties believe that Public Service's 2012-13 Biennial Electric and Natural Gas DSM Plan ("the 2012-13 DSM Plan"), as modified by the terms of this Stipulation, is consistent with §§ 40-3.2-103 and 40-3.2-104, C.R.S.; and the Commission's Gas DSM Rules, 4 C.C.R. 723-4-4750 through 4760, except to the extent such rules have been waived in accordance with Decision No. C11-0645 issued in Docket No. 10A-554EG. The Settling Parties also believe that the 2012-13 DSM Plan, as amended by this Stipulation, is consistent with the Commission's directive that the Company should strive to meet or exceed the Commission approved electric energy savings goals for each year that it implements a new DSM Plan. The 2012-13 DSM Plan, as amended, has been designed to meet the Commission approved electric energy savings goals for 2012 of 329 GWh and to achieve electric energy savings of 345 GWh for 2013 which is 11 GWh short of the 356 GWh Commission-approved goal for 2013. For 2013, although the electric DSM Plan, as amended by this Stipulation, continues to reflect a modest gap between the

forecasted energy savings from the Plan and the 356 GWh Commission-approved goal, the Company agrees that it shall work to develop and implement strategies to close that gap for 2013 over the course of the 2012 Plan year.

The Settling Parties agree that Public Service has the discretion and the responsibility to manage the proposed gas and electric DSM Plan to meet and attempt to exceed the electric energy savings goals established by the Commission in Docket No. 10A-554EG and the demand response and natural gas savings goals established in this proceeding. In implementing the 2012-13 DSM Plan, Public Service agrees to launch and or continue in effect all of the programs identified and described in the 2012-13 DSM Plan, as amended by this Stipulation, and not to discontinue or significantly modify such programs except after 60-days notice as authorized in Paragraph 89 of Decision No. C11-0442.

The Settling Parties recommend that the Commission authorize the Company to continue in effect or implement each of the programs described in the 2012-13 DSM Plan, together with the amendments and additions to such programs that are described in this Stipulation.

The Company may in its discretion file an application seeking pre-approval of the technical assumptions associated with any new program offerings, or approval to incur costs in excess of 113.8 and 113.5 percent of its annual budgets for its electric DSM portfolio in 2012 and 2013, respectively, or 125 percent of the annual budget for its natural gas DSM portfolio. The Settling Parties recommend that the Commission endeavor to act upon such an Application as expeditiously as possible.

2. **Modifications to the 2012-13 DSM Plan.** In the course of negotiations, the Settling Parties have discussed with Public Service various details of the Company's proposed products. As a result of these discussions, Public Service has agreed to add certain products and to make specific changes to certain of the DSM products included in the 2012-13 DSM Plan as originally filed with its Application.

To the extent that the product changes and additions that Public Service has agreed to make are intended to assist in offsetting the 20 GWh shortfall that existed between the Company's 2013 DSM Plan, as originally filed, and the Commission approved electric energy savings goal for 2013, they are described in Section 5 below. Additional product-related changes to which the Company has agreed are then described in Section 6. Some of the product-related changes and additions discussed in this Stipulation affect the Company's originally proposed electric and gas DSM budgets and energy savings targets for 2012 and 2013. Attachment A to this Stipulation is a table reflecting the impact of each of the program changes agreed to in terms of both budget and energy savings.

The Settling Parties agree that the revised budget amounts for 2012-13 as set forth in Section 9 of this Stipulation reflect the impact of the agreed upon product changes and additions to the extent this impact is known as of the date of this Stipulation. The Settling Parties further agree that the Company shall be permitted to recover the budget amounts for 2012 and 2013 detailed in Sections 9 and 11 through changes to the electric and gas DSMCA riders to be effective January 1, 2012 and January 1, 2013, respectively. However, the Settling Parties agree that the Company's flexibility to exceed the approved budget for the electric DSM portfolio without prior

Commission approval shall be limited in 2012 to 13.8 percent and shall be limited in 2013 to 13.5 percent.

The Settling Parties agree that for 2013 the Company shall also be permitted prospective recovery of up to \$3 million in addition to the 2013 electric DSM budget detailed in Section 9 for the purpose of meeting the Company's estimated shortfall of electric savings in 2013. Subject to the limitation described below relating to budget for expansion of the Energy Feedback Pilot, the Company shall be allowed to recover the following through the 2013 electric DSMCA: (1) the 2013 electric DSM budget described in Section 9 of this Stipulation; and (2) up to \$3 million in addition to the budget based on the Company's forecast of cost it will incur to meet the shortfall in energy savings as set forth in the notice filed on November 1, 2012 in accordance with Section 5.g. The recoverable costs shall include costs for any innovative technology programs implemented under Section 5.d. Assuming that the Company seeks the entire \$3 million available to it for 2013, the overall budget to be recovered would be \$86,033,733. Notwithstanding the above, the Company's 2013 electric DSM budget shall be reduced by \$500,000 (and these funds shall not be recoverable through the 2013 DSMCA) if the 2013 expansion of the Energy Feedback Pilot discussed in Section 5.a. cannot be accomplished cost-effectively.

The 13.5 percent excess available to the Company based on the approved budget in Section 9 shall be reduced by any amount requested up to \$3 million. For example, 13.5 percent of the 2013 budget is \$11.2 million. If the Company uses the \$3 million to address the shortfall of electric energy savings in 2013, it would have

Appendix A
Decision No. R11-1326
Docket No. 11A-631EG
Page 7 of 40

approximately \$8.2 million that could be recovered through the true up for that year without having to file a new application.

- 3. **Participation by All Classes of Customers.** The Settling Parties believe that, with respect to the customer segments targeted by the Company's 2012-13 DSM Plan, as amended, (*i.e.*, residential, business, and low-income) and to the breadth of program offerings contemplated for each segment, Public Service's proposed electric and gas DSM portfolios in the 2012-13 DSM Plan as amended by this Stipulation, have been designed to afford all classes of customers an opportunity to participate as required by §§ 40-3.2-103 and 40-3.2-104, C.R.S.
- 4. **2012 and 2013 Energy and Demand Savings.** The Settling Parties agree that Public Service shall use its best efforts to achieve at least 330 GWh in electric energy savings in 2012, For 2013, the Company agrees to use its best efforts to achieve the Commission approved electric energy savings goal and save at least 356 GWh, although the Settling Parties recognize the Company's currently forecasted electric energy savings of 345 GWh for 2013 under its 2013 DSM Plan as amended by this Stipulation continues to reflect a modest shortfall. These electric energy savings targets include a reduction of approximately 4.8 GWh in 2012 and 4.4 GWh in 2013 due to the Company's agreement to reduce the Net-to-Gross ratio for compact fluorescent bulbs installed as part of the Residential Home Lighting program from .90 to .85 and an increase of 3.5 GWh and 13.6 GWh in 2012 and 2013, respectively on account of the specific program changes and additions discussed below and reflected in Attachment A to this Stipulation. These reductions and increases result in net reduction in 2012 of 1.2 GWh and a net increase in 2013 of 9.2 GWh.

The Settling Parties also agree that the Company shall use best efforts to achieve at least 95.5 MW and 87.9 MW in incremental demand reduction in 2012 and 2013, respectively, from the combined effect of its proposed electric energy efficiency programs, and the Saver's Switch, Interruptible Service Option Credit (ISOC) and the Third Party Demand Response programs. The Settling Parties request that the Commission approve these levels of incremental demand reduction as the Company's demand reduction goals for 2012 and 2013. As ordered by the Commission in Decision No. C11-0442, the Company shall address the market potential for demand reductions from load management, demand response, and interruptible services and demand reduction goals for the period 2014 through 2020 in an application to be filed on or before April 26, 2012.

The Settling Parties further agree that the Company shall use its best efforts to achieve natural gas savings of at least 435,054 dekatherms in 2012 and 428,309 dekatherms in 2013. The Settling Parties request that the Commission approve these levels of gas savings, in combination with actual gas program expenditures to calculate dekatherms saved per dollar expended, as the energy savings targets that shall be used in 2012 and 2013 by the Company for the purpose of calculating a bonus under Rules 4754 and 4760.

#### Plan Modifications to Address the 20 GWh Shortfall for 2013.

a. **Energy Feedback Pilot**. The Settling Parties agree that as part of the Company's effort to fill the shortfall between the Company's DSM Plan as filed for 2013 and the Commission's 2013 energy savings goal of 356 GWh, the Company shall work to expand its Energy Feedback Pilot during 2012 to include an additional 50,000

Appendix A
Decision No. R11-1326
Docket No. 11A-631EG
Page 9 of 40

homes at an additional cost of approximately \$500,000 for 2013. The Settling Parties understand that the Pilot will only be expanded if the Company can do so and achieve a TRC that is ≥ 1 for the expanded pilot program in 2013. It is expected that such an expansion of the Energy Feedback Pilot will yield additional energy savings of approximately 8.6 GWh. The Settling Parties agree that the electric DSM budget for 2013 shall be increased by \$500,000 to reflect the expansion of the Energy Feedback Pilot.

- b. **Showerhead Program.** The Company also agrees to reinstate its Showerhead program targeted at gas and electric customers, with anticipated participation of 23,917 households in 2012 and 23,917 households in 2013. It is expected that the inclusion of the Showerhead program will result in additional electric energy savings of 466,836Gen kWh and a cost of \$61,600 each year for 2012 and 2013. The impact of restoring the Showerhead program on the Company's gas DSM portfolio is expected to be additional energy savings of 18,125 Dth at a cost of \$225,000 each year for 2012 and 2013. The Settling Parties agree that the additional cost of the Showerhead Program shall be added to the gas and electric DSM budgets for 2012 and 2013.
- c. **Refrigerator Recycling.** The Company agrees to work over the remainder of 2011 to develop an expanded refrigerator recycling program to include freezers and primary refrigerators, dependent on cost-effectiveness, beginning in first quarter of 2012. Such an expansion is expected to yield additional energy savings of approximately 3.0 GWh and 4.5 GWh in 2012 and 2013, respectively. The Settling Parties agree that the Company's electric DSM budget as originally filed, shall be

adjusted to reflect an additional \$950,000 for 2012 and \$1,260,000 for 2013 to accommodate the addition of primary refrigerators and freezers to the refrigerator recycling program. The Company also agrees to release an RFP to secure a third party program implementer for the expanded Refrigerator Recycling program starting in 2012.

RFP for Innovative Technology. Additionally, in order to help address d. the energy savings shortfall for 2013, the Company agrees to issue a Request for Proposals during the first quarter of 2012 intended to solicit program proposals for achieving electric energy savings during 2013 by means of innovative program ideas for niche markets or markets where the company is under serving a customer segment. Program ideas brought forward during the Settlement discussions may utilize this avenue for inclusion in the DSM Plan. The Company commits to bring forward one or more new programs if, after Company review, it appears that such programs are likely to be cost effective and will help the Company meet its 2013 energy savings goal. New programs may be implemented as either pilot or full scale programs, and will be added to the DSM portfolio by means of the 60-day notice process. The Settling Parties agree that so long as any programs implemented through an innovative RFP have a TRC greater than 1, then any costs the Company incurs in connection with innovative technology programs developed in response to the RFP that are within the approved 2013 budget (including the \$3 million described in Section 2 above), shall be recoverable through the DSMCA beginning January 1, 2013. The Company shall ensure appropriate measurement and verification to confirm both the cost-effectiveness and the achieved energy savings of innovative technology programs.

Appendix A
Decision No. R11-1326
Docket No. 11A-631EG
Page 11 of 40

e. Low Income Single Family Weatherization. The Company agrees to add new cost effective measures to the Low Income Single Family Weatherization program to expand participation and savings. The specific measures currently under evaluation are high efficiency water heaters, storm windows, crawl space insulation, and attic insulation in manufactured homes. Such an expansion is expected to yield additional energy savings of approximately 0.07 GWh, and 3,458 Dth in both 2012 and 2013 and result in budget increases of \$32,433 per year to the electric portfolio and \$220,000 per year to the gas portfolio respectively.

f. **Air Conditioner Tune-ups.** The Company agrees to issue an RFP as soon as possible, but no later than the first quarter of 2012, for a combined residential and small commercial customer air conditioner tune-up program. If in response to the RFP the Company believes it can implement a cost effective program serving this combined market, the Company will propose the program for implementation via the 60-day notice process no later than October 1, 2012.

g. **Process for Addressing Remaining Shortfall.** The Settling Parties recognize that even with the additions to the electric DSM portfolio agreed to as part of this Stipulation, it may be necessary for the Company to expand one or more of the electric DSM programs included in the 2013 Plan beyond the levels currently forecasted or to add additional programs in order to achieve the Commission's established energy savings goal for 2013 of 356 GWh. The Company agrees to use best efforts to achieve the 356 GWh goal within the 113.5 percent budget flexibility that has been agreed to in this Stipulation for 2013. However, as indicated in Section 2 above, to the extent the Company expects to incur costs to implement a new DSM program for 2013 that will

Appendix A
Decision No. R11-1326
Docket No. 11A-631EG
Page 12 of 40

exceed 113.5 percent of the Commission approved budget for that year it shall file a formal application for approval.

The Company agrees to develop a specific plan for achieving the 356 GWh electric energy savings goal for 2013, incorporating the expected additional savings from each of the electric DSM programs added as a result of this Stipulation. The Company shall advise the Commission and the Settling Parties of such plan and associated cost by means of a Notice filed on or before November 1, 2012.

- 6. Other Program-Specific Changes and Additions.
- a. **Insulation Rebate Program.** The Company agrees that it shall work to evaluate and develop a quality assurance program to ensure program standards and guidelines are met. The Company agrees to consult with interested stakeholders as this quality assurance program is developed. The Company will increase gas budgets \$134,000 and electric budgets \$16,000 per year to fund this quality assurance (QA) component. As part of the QA component, the company agrees to require air sealing, if necessary, in order to meet a to-be-defined air tightness standard for the customer to participate in the Insulation Rebate Program.
- b. Home Performance with Energy Star. The Company will pilot the energy concierge concept in 2012 through the Home Energy program. We will take a sample of 300 audits and send a concierge out with the auditor with the objective to increase conversion rates from audit to HPwES completion. Concierges will engage customers in reviewing possible energy savings and assist customers in collecting contractor bids and applying for rebates. As part of this pilot the Company will evaluate best practices from programs like Boulder's Energy Smart program as well as ideas

Appendix A
Decision No. R11-1326
Docket No. 11A-631EG
Page 13 of 40

from interested stakeholders to determine if additional services such as direct install measures can be included. This pilot will result in an estimated HPwES program budget increase of \$17,250 for gas and \$17,250 for electric. If a significant increase in participation can be attributed to the concierge service and the program remains cost effective the concierge concept will be added to the full program in 2013 by means of a 60-day notice.

- c. **Residential Home Lighting**. The Company agrees that the net-to-gross ratio to be used in calculating net energy savings associated with compact fluorescent bulbs installed as part of the Residential Home Lighting Program shall be reduced from .90 to .85 for both 2012 and 2013. The Company expects that the effect of this change will be a decrease in electric energy savings of approximately 4.8 GWh in 2012 and 4.4 GWh in 2013.
- d. **Electric Vehicles**: As part of the application it will file in April 2012 for approval of demand response goals for 2014 to 2020, the Company agrees to address the following: (1) electric vehicles as a possible future source of demand, (2) possible demand savings or reduction options related to electric vehicles and (3) how the Electric Vehicle Charging Station Pilot is expected to contribute to the Company's understanding of demand impacts related to electric vehicle charging.
- e. **Energy Efficiency Financing**. The Company agrees it will work with interested stakeholders between now and June 1, 2012 to develop a program to support financing of energy efficiency retrofits by residential and small business customers. If during this time, a cost effective model for such a program can be developed for Public Service's territory and the Company receives interest from third party entities to support

Appendix A
Decision No. R11-1326
Docket No. 11A-631EG
Page 14 of 40

implementation; the Company shall file an application for approval of such a program with the Commission with the objective of implementing it beginning January 1, 2013. The financing program would be implemented in partnership with other entities such as banks, state government, or local governments. It is agreed to by the parties that the financing mechanism will not be an on-bill payment mechanism or include a lost loan pool supported by Xcel Energy ratepayers.

- f. Energy Star New Homes. Because many Colorado jurisdictions are implementing or considering code updates, the Company agrees that it will not identify in any of its Plan documents specific jurisdictions with "more stringent codes." The "City of Boulder Rebate Structure" will be renamed as a "Rebate Structure for Jurisdictions Requiring Low HERS Index Scores." Other references to any specific jurisdiction mentions in the ENERGY STAR New Homes product description will be removed or be replaced with "jurisdictions requiring low HERS Index scores."
- 7. **Waste to Energy Projects.** During the course of settlement discussions, SWEEP advocated for including waste to energy projects as a conservation measure in the context of the Company's custom efficiency program. It is the Company's view that, under current Colorado law, waste to energy projects are more appropriately viewed as Eligible Energy Resources as defined in C.R.S. §40-2-124(a), rather than as a source of energy conservation under C.R.S. §40-3.2-104. However, the Company also recognizes that it does not currently offer contracting opportunities to customers who install Eligible Energy Resources on their premises, other than for on-site photovoltaic generation systems. The Company agrees that, on or before June 30, 2012, it shall file an application and/or advice letter with the Commission to implement a program

applicable to Eligible Energy Resources installed on customer premises, including appropriate compensation for the customer, in addition to photovoltaic generation systems. The Company agrees to consult with interested stakeholders as it develops this application and/or advice letter.

- 8. **Influenced Savings Projects.** The Company agrees to withdraw its request in its application to recognize and count the savings associated with influenced savings from custom projects.
- 9. **2012-13 DSM Budgets.** The Settling Parties agree to recommend that the Commission approve a total DSM portfolio budget for 2012 of \$90,503,209, including \$77,284,877 for our electric DSM programs and \$13,218,332 for natural gas. For 2013, the Settling Parties recommend approval of total DSM expenditures of approximately \$96,318,144, including \$83,033,783 for our electric DSM programs and \$13,284,361 for natural gas. The changes to the recommended budgets for 2012 and 2013, including the increases to both the electric and gas budgets referenced in Section 2 above, are specified in the table included as Attachment A to this Stipulation. The Settling Parties agree that the Company's proposed 2012-13 DSM Plan and associated budgets as modified by the Stipulation were developed giving due consideration to the impact of the DSM Plan on non-participants and on low-income customers as required by C.R.S. §40-3.2-104(4).

Notwithstanding the electric and gas DSM budgets agreed to as part of this Stipulation, the Settling Parties understand and acknowledge that the Company has the right to file and, in some circumstances under Decision No. C11-0442, is required to file a formal application for approval to implement DSM programs that are currently not part

of the 2012-2013 DSM Plan. The Settling Parties agree that such an application may include a request for the additional budget dollars needed to implement such new programs and that such a request may exceed the 113.8 and 113.5 percent budget flexibility for the electric program agreed to in this Stipulation for 2012 and 2013, respectively and the 125 percent budget flexibility afforded for the gas DSM program.

10. Updated Avoided Costs and Technical Assumptions. With the exception of Trial Staff, the Settling Parties agree that the Commission should approve the Company's proposed updated avoided costs as contained in Appendix C to the 2012-13 DSM Plan and technical assumptions set forth in the Technical Reference Manual appended to the 2012-13 DSM Plan as Appendix E. These include the deemed savings and net-to-gross ratios used for purposes of developing the 2012 and 2013 gas and electric DSM plans. With the exception of the specific change referenced below, the net-to-gross ratios, for which the Settling Parties recommend approval, are set forth in the Planning Assumptions section of the 2012-13 DSM Plan. As part of this Stipulation the Settling Parties have agreed to a change to the net-to-gross ratio associated with the CFL's within the Company's Home Lighting product from .90 to 0.85 as set forth in Section 6, infra. Commission Staff does not oppose the approval of the avoided costs referenced above.

The Settling Parties agree that for purposes of calculating the gross savings associated with each of the prescriptive gas or electric DSM product measures offered as part of the gas and electric DSM portfolios, Public Service shall use the technical assumptions relating to the energy savings calculations for such measures actually

installed during calendar year 2012 and 2013. Such savings shall be referred to as "deemed savings."

The Settling Parties further agree, that the Company shall use the net-to-gross ratios set forth in the Planning Assumptions Section of the 2012-13 DSM Plan, as modified by this Stipulation, and the technical assumptions set forth in the Company's Technical Reference Manual (Appendix E to the 2012-13 DSM Plan) relating to incremental customer O&M savings (for prescriptive measures only), customer O&M costs (for prescriptive measures only), incremental customer capital costs (for prescriptive measures only), and the deemed savings formulas and other technical assumptions set forth in the Manual, for purposes of determining program and portfolio cost effectiveness and for calculating annual portfolio net economic benefits based on measures actually installed during calendar year 2012 and 2013.

With the exception of Trial Staff, the Settling Parties agree that, for purposes of determining program and portfolio cost effectiveness and for calculating annual portfolio net economic benefits based on measures actually installed during calendar year 2012 and 2013, Public Service shall use the updated avoided cost assumptions set forth in Appendix C attached to the 2012-13 DSM Plan. Specifically, the Settling Parties, except Trial Staff, agree that the changes in the methodology used by the Company to determine avoided marginal energy and generation capacity costs are reasonable and should be approved in this proceeding. Trial Staff does not oppose the methodology just described or its approval in this docket.

When filing the annual status report of 2012 results on April 1, 2013, and the 2013 results on April 1, 2014, the Company will include a comparison of the resulting

Appendix A
Decision No. R11-1326
Docket No. 11A-631EG
Page 18 of 40

net benefits and TRC tests using the former avoided cost methodology and the updated methodology approved for this Plan.

The Settling Parties agree that the Company shall use the approved avoided costs and other technical assumptions (unless modified through a 60-day notice) to calculate the savings and net economic benefits associated with DSM products actually installed during 2012 and 2013

- 11. **ISOC** and Third-Party Demand Response Budgets. With the exception of Trial Staff, the Settling Parties agree that the Company shall be permitted to recover its 2012 forecasted expenditures for the ISOC program of \$26,390,287, including both the credits paid to customers and the Company's forecast of its administration and marketing costs for 2012, and for the Third Party Demand Response program of \$3,008,400 through the combination of base rates and the electric DSMCA rider that shall become effective on January 1, 2012. The Company's recovery of its ISOC and Third Party Demand Response costs shall be subject to true-up to ensure recovery of the actual costs incurred. Trial Staff does not oppose the provisions in this Section.
- 12. **DSMCA Tariffs.** The Settling Parties agree to recommend to the Commission that it authorize the Company to implement changes in the electric and gas DSMCA rates to become effective on January 1, 2012 as necessary to recover the approved gas and electric DSM budgets set forth in Section 9 and the Company's 2012 forecast of expenditures for its ISOC and Third Party Demand Response programs as described in Section 11.
- 13. **Evaluation, Measurement & Verification Plan.** The Company shall continue its ongoing measurement and verification activities with respect to each of its

prescriptive DSM products as set forth in the 2012-2013 DSM plan filed with the Commission in this proceeding. As part of this Stipulation the Company agrees to expand its ongoing M&V with respect to its prescriptive programs commencing in 2012 and continuing through 2013 in order to gather information from program participants regarding the extent to which such participants would have undertaken such energy saving actions in the absence of the rebate provided by the Company (participant free-ridership). This information will be used together with certain benchmarking information gathered as part of the Company's comprehensive review of technical assumptions discussed below to assess whether any changes should be made to the net-to-gross ratios used by the Company in the next DSM Plan. The participant free-ridership information will be made available for use in comprehensive program evaluations. In addition, the Company will include in the 2012 and 2013 annual status reports tables that display the gross and the net savings for each program and product.

The Company agrees to perform comprehensive program evaluations of the following programs in 2012 and 2013:

2012 Comprehensive Program Evaluations:

- Residential Home Performance
- Business Process Efficiency
- Residential High Efficiency Air Conditioning new addition which will require \$200,000 to be added to the Program Evaluation line item budget for 2012

2013 Comprehensive Program Evaluations

Appendix A Decision No. R11-1326 Docket No. 11A-631EG Page 20 of 40

Low Income Energy Savings Kits

Business Compressed Air

Business Segment Efficiency

The company will incorporate both the Residential Home Performance evaluation and the results of the 2011 Whole House Study Pilot when reviewing any changes to the design of the Residential Home Performance Program in connection with the comprehensive evaluation of this program during 2012.

In addition to other comprehensive program evaluations that will be performed in 2014 and 2015, the Company will include two programs as a result of this Stipulation – Residential Home Lighting and Business Lighting. Since these two programs will undergo significant changes during the 2012/13 period due to the implementation of the Energy Independence and Security Act of 2007, the evaluations of these programs will take place when the programs are in more of a steady state condition in the 2014-15 time period. Therefore, both evaluations will be added to the 2015 evaluations. Other program evaluations for 2014 and 2015 will be decided prior to filing the next Biennial Plan for 2014/2015.

Lastly, prior to filing its biennial DSM Plan for 2014 and 2015, the Company agrees to engage a consultant to perform a comprehensive review of all of the technical assumptions used to determine savings achieved as a result of the prescriptive programs offered by the Company. As part of this review, the consultant shall also conduct a review of literature and other studies available regarding applicable net-to-gross ratios in order to benchmark the Company's net-to-gross ratios against such ratios used by other utilities in other states. This information will be used by the

Company in connection with the data gathered as part of its M&V activities to assess whether changes should be made to any of the net to gross ratios used for prescriptive programs proposed as part of the 2014-2015 DSM Plan. All evaluation study results will be shared through notice via the Company's DSM website.

## IV. GENERAL PROVISIONS

The Settling Parties agree to join in a motion that requests the Commission to approve this Stipulation and to support this Stipulation.

This Stipulation is a negotiated compromise of issues raised in this proceeding relating to the Company's proposed gas and electric DSM plan for calendar years 2012 and 2013 and the proposed changes to the electric and gas DSMCA to become effective January 1, 2012. By signing this Stipulation and by joining the motion to adopt the Stipulation filed with the Commission, the Settling Parties acknowledge that they pledge support for Commission approval and subsequent implementation of these provisions.

Nothing in this Stipulation shall bind any of the Settling Parties with respect to any position such party may take in any subsequent proceeding before this Commission in which the Company's DSM programs or plans are at issue, including any application that may be filed by the Company in accordance with this Stipulation or Decision No. C11-0442E. The Settling Parties agree that nothing in this Stipulation shall constitute precedent for purposes of any future proceeding.

This Stipulation shall not become effective until the issuance of a final Commission Order approving the Stipulation, which Order does not contain any modification of its terms and conditions that is unacceptable to any of the Settling

Parties. In the event the Commission modifies this Stipulation in a manner unacceptable to any Party, that Party shall have the right to withdraw from this Stipulation and proceed to hearing on the issues that may be appropriately raised by that party in Docket No. 11A-631EG. The withdrawing Party shall notify the Commission and the Parties to this Stipulation by e-mail within five business days of the Commission's final order modifying the Stipulation that the Party is withdrawing from the Stipulation and that the Party is ready to proceed to hearing; the e-mail notice shall designate the precise issue or issues on which the Party desires to proceed to hearing (the "Hearing Notice").

The withdrawal of a Party shall not automatically terminate this Stipulation as to the withdrawing Party or any other Party. However, within five business days of the date of the Hearing Notice from the first withdrawing Party, all Settling Parties shall confer to arrive at a comprehensive list of issues that shall proceed to hearing and a list of issues that remain settled as a result of the first Party's withdrawal from this Stipulation. Within five business days of the date of the Hearing Notice, the Settling Parties shall file with the Commission a formal notice containing the list of issues that shall proceed to hearing and the list of issues that remain settled. The Parties who proceed to hearing shall have and be entitled to exercise all rights with respect to the issues that are heard that they would have had in the absence of this Stipulation. Hearing shall be scheduled on all of the issues designated in the formal notice filed with the Commission as soon as practicable.

Appendix A
Decision No. R11-1326
Docket No. 11A-631EG
Page 23 of 40

The Settling Parties agree that the negotiations or discussions undertaken in conjunction with the Stipulation shall not be admissible into evidence in this or any other proceeding, except as may be necessary in any proceeding to enforce this Stipulation.

Approval by the Commission of this Stipulation shall constitute a determination that the Stipulation represents a just, equitable and reasonable resolution of all issues that were or could have been contested among the Settling Parties in the above-captioned proceeding. The Settling Parties state that reaching Stipulation in this docket by means of a negotiated settlement is in the public interest and that the results of the compromises and settlements reflected by this Stipulation are just, reasonable and in the public interest.

All Settling Parties have had the opportunity to participate in the drafting of this Stipulation. There shall be no legal presumption that any specific Settling Party was the drafter of this Stipulation.

This Stipulation may be executed in counterparts, all of which when taken together shall constitute the entire agreement with respect to the issues addressed by this Stipulation.

Dated this 10<sup>th</sup> day of November, 2011.

## PUBLIC SERVICE COMPANY OF COLORADO

Karen Hyde

Vice President, Rates & Regulatory Affairs

Xcel Energy Services Inc. 1800 Larimer St.,14<sup>th</sup> Floor Denver, Colorado 80202

Agent for Public Service Company of Colorado

By:

Ann E. Hopfenbeck, #15460

Ducker, Montgomery, Lewis & Bess, P.C.

c/o Xcel Energy Services Inc. 1800 Larimer St., 11<sup>th</sup> Floor Denver, Colorado 80202 Phone: (303) 294-2059

Fax: (303) 294-2988

E-mail: <u>ann.e.hopfenbeck@xcelenergy.com</u>

Ahopfenbeck@duckerlaw.com

Attorney for Public Service Company of Colorado

# COLORADO OFFICE OF CONSUMER COUNSEL

By:

P.B. Schechter

Rate/Financial Analyst

Colorado Office of Consumer Counsel

1560 Broadway, Suite 200

Denver, CO 80202 Phone: (303) 894-2124 Fax: (303) 894-2117

pb.schechter@dora.state.co.us

Office of the Attorney General John W. Suthers, Attorney General

Approved as to Form:

By:

Stephen W. Southwick, 30389 First Assistant Attorney General Office of the Attorney General 1525 Sherman St., 7<sup>th</sup> Floor

Denver, CO 80203 Phone: (303) 866-5869 Fax: (303) 866-5691

stephen.southwick@state.co.us

## CITY OF BOULDER

Debra S. Kalish #18858

Senior Assistant City Attorney

City of Boulder

Box 791 1777 Broadway

Boulder, CO 80306 - 0791

303 441 3020

303 441 3859 FAX

Kalishd@bouldercolorado.gov

**Energy Efficiency Busines? Coalition** 

Mark D. Detsky

Attorney Reg. #35276 Dietze & Davis, P.C. 2060 Broadway, Suite 400

Boulder, CO 80302

Telephone: 303.447.1375 Facsimile:303.440.9036 MDetsky@dietzedavis.com

## Southwest Energy Efficiency Project

By:

Sue Ellen Harrison #5770

Sue Ellen Harrison P.C.

840 12th Street

Boulder CO 80302

Telephone: 303.931.4433 seharrisonpc@gmail.com

## **COLORADO RENEWABLE ENERGY SOCIETY**

Vincent P. Calvano, #40634

1185 Berea Dr. Boulder, CO 80305 (703) 975-6085

vincecalvano@gmail.com

Attorney for Colorado Renewable Energy Society

## Colorado Solar Energy Industries Association

By: Susan Colli

Susan L. Perkins, Managing Member

Perkins Ruschena, LLC

8400 E. Crescent Parkway, Suite 600

Greenwood Village, CO 80111 Telephone: 303.779.8100 Facsimile: 303.484.7774

Susan@PerkinsEnergyLaw.com

Western Resource Advocates

Victoria R. Mardell

Victoria R. Mandell, #17900 Senior Staff Attorney Western Resource Advocates 2260 Baseline Rd, Suite 200 Boulder CO 80302 303-444-1188 x224

John Nielsen

**Energy Program Director** Western Resource Advocates 2260 Baseline Rd, Suite 200 Boulder CO 80302

# STAFF OF THE COLORADO PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION

PAUL C. CALDARA

Professional Engineer, Energy Section Colorado Public Utilities Commission

1560 Broadway, Suite 250 Denver, CO 80202

Telephone: (303) 894-2025

E-Mail: Paul.Caldara@dora.state.co.us

### APPROVED AS TO FORM:

JOHN W. SUTHERS Attorney General

ANNE K. BOTTERUD, 20726\*
First Assistant Attorney General
Business and Licensing Section
Attorneys for Trial Staff of the Colorado

**Public Utilities Commission** 

1525 Sherman Street, 7th Floor Denver, Colorado 80203 Telephone: (303) 866-3867 FAX: (303) 866-5691

E-Mail: anne.botterud@state.co.us

\*Counsel of Record

## Colorado Governor's Energy Office

JERRY W. GOAD, 11284\*

Senior Assistant Attorney General

Natural Resources and Environment Section Attorneys for Colorado Governor's Energy Office

1525 Sherman Street, 5th Floor

Denver, Colorado 80203 Telephone: (303) 866-5117 Facsimile: (303) 866-3558 jerry.goad@state.co.us \*Counsel of Record

**Boulder County** 

Leslie Wright Lacy, #14470 Assistant County Attorney

P.O. Box 471

Boulder, CO 80306 - 0471 Telephone: 303.441.4540 Facsimile: 303.441.4794 llacy@bouldercounty.org

EnerNOC, Inc.

Mark D. Detsky

Associate Attorney #35276 Dietze & Davis, P.C.

2060 Broadway, Suite 400

Boulder, CO 80302

Telephone: 303.447.1375 Facsimile:303.440.9036 MDetsky@dietzedavis.com

## Impacts of the Proposed Settlement:

## **ELECTRIC:**

		2012	2	2013					
		Budget	KWh		Budget	KWh			
As Filed in the Plan	\$	76,007,594	330,548,725	\$	86,003,911	356,000,000			
Settlement	\$	1,277,283	(1,241,384)	\$	1,870,033	9,238,332			
Less: Product Development Unidentified		-	<u>-</u>	\$	(4,840,161)	(19,996,172)			
Total	\$	77,284,877	329,307,341	\$	83,033,783	345,242,160			
		201	2		2013	3			
GAS:		Budget	dth		Budget	dth			
As Filed in the Plan	\$	12,622,082	413,471	\$	12,705,361	406,726			
Settlement	\$	596,250	21,583	\$	579,000	21,583			
Total	\$	13,218,332	435,054	\$	13,284,361	428,309			

ELECTRIC	iniai Pian Settlement Matrix	As Filed						Settlement Impact									
			201	2 Plan	7.01.		2013	Plan			20	012 Plan	501111	l l l l l l l l l l l l l l l l l l l	20:	13 Plan	
Program	Product	Participants B	udget	kW Savings	kWh Savings	Participants Bud	get	kW Savings	kWh Savings	Participants	Budget	kW Savings	kWh Savings	Participants	Budget	kW Savings	kWh Savings
Business	Compressed Air Efficiency	73 \$	838,191	620	4,137,552	73 \$	888,648	620	4,137,552								
	Computer Efficiency	2,666 \$	500,637	1,004	7,342,230	2,816 \$	564,924	1,074	7,849,377								
	Cooling Efficiency	301 \$	2,976,091	2,121		304 \$	3,125,756	2,131	7,466,289								
	Custom Efficiency	34 \$	1,903,248	717		38 \$	2,044,473	825	8,748,317								
	Data Center Efficiency	12 \$	935,135	506		18 \$	1,166,224	755	9,138,385								
	Energy Management Systems	56 \$	1,541,500	243	8,495,894	62 \$	1,657,636	269	9,406,168								
	Heating Efficiency	1			2,122,221		_,,,,,,,,		0,100,200								
	Lighting Efficiency	1,140 \$	8,388,395	12,040	62,917,758	981 \$	8,530,227	10,880	58,957,958								
	Motor & Drive Efficiency	1,589 \$	5,433,060	3,458		1,924 \$	5,883,811	3,860	23,994,123								
	New Construction	91 \$	6,385,394	8,147		74 \$	7,299,374	9,808	24,790,163								
	Process Efficiency	12 \$	2,017,096	782		15 \$	2,569,383	1,228	17,332,277								
	Recommissioning	85 \$	1,319,172	330		84 \$	1,227,650	328	5,868,657								
	Segment Efficiency	60 \$	1,185,732	347		73 \$	1,269,669	554	4,164,250								
	Self-Directed Custom Efficiency	13 \$	1,908,790	1,957		13 \$	1,914,342	1,957	8,975,070								
	Small Business Lighting	165 \$	3,011,058	2,108		195 \$	3,938,056	2,609	14,373,890								
	Standard Offer	12 \$	1,668,234	1,287	9,138,595	12 \$	1,636,288	1,287	9,138,595								
Business Program Total		6,309	40,011,734	35,667		6,682 \$	43,716,462	38,184	214,341,071		s				\$ .		
Residential	Consumer Electronics (NEW)	5,305	.0,011,734	23,007	250,525,500	5,552 3	.5,, 10,402	55,104	,1,0 .1								
	ENERGY STAR New Homes	2,580 \$	5 532,721	89	1,543,624	2,629 \$	548,054	97	1,615,423								
	Evaporative Cooling Rebates	4,298	2,282,325	6,042		4,630 \$	2,515,410	6,550	4,086,155								
	Heating System Rebates	4,230 \$	. 2,202,323	0,042	3,771,471	4,030 3	2,313,410	0,330	+,000,133								
	High Efficiency Air Conditioning	2,010 \$	2,405,385	2,871	2,372,400	2,010 \$	2,415,130	2,871	2,372,400								
	Home Lighting & Recycling	522,500	5,440,714	11,962		535,000 \$	5,549,253	10,975	87,186,502			(1,795	) (4,778,220	<b>\</b>		(1,795)	(4,359,325)
	Home Performance with ENERGY STAR	200 \$	268,341	295		300 \$	328,344	442	451,624		\$ 17,25	* * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * *	(4,778,220	,		(1,753)	(4,535,523)
	Insulation Rebate	3,120 \$	99,505	540		3,120 \$	99,505	540	431,024		\$ 16,00				\$ 16,000		
	Refrigerator Recycling	1,800 \$	492,459	173		2,000 \$	530,121	144	1,061,042	2,450			3,000,000	6,600	-	476	4,500,000
	School Education Kits	30,000	1,538,568	535		30,000 \$	1,538,732	422	4,528,665	2,450	\$ 950,00	0 241	3,000,000	0,000	\$ 1,260,000	4/0	4,500,000
	Showerheads	30,000 \$	1,538,568	555	5,809,487	30,000 \$	1,538,732	422	4,528,665	2,631	\$ 61,60	0	466,836	2,361	\$ 61,600		466,836
	Water Heater Rebate	200 \$	100,100	59	517,787	200 \$	100,100	59	517,787		\$ 61,60	0	400,830	2,301	\$ 61,600	0	400,830
Desidential Drogram Total	Water Heater Repate	566,708	13,160,118		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	579,889 \$	13,624,650	1			\$ 1,044,85	0 /4 540	14 244 204	) 0.004	ć 4.227.000	(4.240)	607.544
Residential Program Total	Residential Saver's Switch			22,567				<b>22,100</b> 20,865	102,248,592	5,081	\$ 1,044,85	0 (1,549	(1,311,384	8,961	\$ 1,337,600	(1,319)	607,511
Load Management	Residential Saver & Switch	19,500 \$	13,326,964 13,326,964	20,865 <b>20,865</b>		19,500 \$	14,075,362 14,075,362	20,865	697,183 <b>697,183</b>								
Load Management Total  Low Income	Energy Savings Kit	10,000 \$	647,664	301		8,250 \$	510,957	194	3,497,334		\$ -	-	-		ş -	-	-
LOW IIICOIIIE	Multi-Family Weatherization	10,000 \$	350,669	96		12 \$	389,446	112	1,283,333								
	Non-Profit Energy Efficiency	25 \$	572,599	282		25 \$	930,248	506	1,800,234								
	Single-Family Weatherization	2,545	1,204,255	342		2,545 \$	1,222,045	314	3,575,259	315	\$ \$ 32,43	3 4:	2 70,000	315	\$ 32,433	42	70,000
Low Income Total	Single-ramily weatherization	12,582	2,775,187	1,021		10,832 \$	3,052,696	1,127	10,156,160							42	70,000
	Business Energy Analysis	400 9		1,021	11,170,941	400 \$		1,127	10,156,160	313	\$ 32,43	3 42	70,000	313	\$ 32,433	42	70,000
Indirect Products & Services	Consumer Education - Business	1,385	992,648			+	1,029,449										
_			153,765			1,385 \$	153,765										
	Consumer Education - Residential Residential Home Energy Audit	34,000 \$	1,232,674			34,000 \$	1,232,674										
Latina Bardada O Carta Are	<u>.</u>	2,175 \$	635,574			2,175 \$	581,677							+			
Indirect Products & Services To		37,960 \$	3,014,661			37,960 \$	2,997,565			-	\$ -	-	-	-	\$ -	-	-
Planning & Research	DSM Planning & Administration	1 !	287,559		-	- \$	305,838										
	Program Evaluations & M&V		384,312		-	- \$	596,873				\$ 200,00	00					
	_	\$	78,097		-	- \$	102,223										
	DSM Market Research	1 9	274,912		-	- \$	263,011										
	DSM Product Development		1,022,558			- \$	1,031,536										
	Energy Feedback Pilot	50,000 \$	379,400	684	8,560,821	50,000 \$	361,048	684	8,560,821					50,000	\$ 500,000		8,560,821
	In-Home Smart Device Pilot	600 \$	1,240,597	-	-	- \$	983,906	-	-								
	Electric Vehicle Charging Station Pilot	- \$	20,000			- \$	20,000										
	Building Code Support (NEW)	+			-	+											
	EE Financing (NEW)	+			-	<del>                                     </del>											
	ES Benchmarking Pilot (NEW)																
nod and the second	Solar Thermal																
Product Development Subtota	1	50,600 \$	2,662,555	684		50,000 \$	2,396,489	684	8,560,821		\$ -	-	-	50,000		-	8,560,821
Planning & Research Total		50,600 \$	3,687,436	684		50,000 \$	3,664,434	684	8,560,821		\$ 200,00		-	50,000		-	8,560,821
PORTFOLIO SUBTOTAL		693,660 \$	75,976,099	80,804	330,548,725	704,863 \$	81,131,169		336,003,828		\$ 1,277,28	3 (1,507	(1,241,384	59,276	\$ 1,870,033	(1,277)	9,238,332
		<b>—</b>				\$	4,840,161	4,937	19,996,172								
Product Development - Future	Unidentified					<b></b>											
		1				<del>                                     </del>											
1000/5	T	1				<del>                                     </del>											
ISOC / EnerNOC Incremental			31,495	16,200		\$	32,581	1,300									
PORTFOLIO TOTAL		693,660 \$	76,007,594	97,004	330,548,725	704,863 \$	86,003,911	89,197	356,000,000	5,396	\$ 1,277,28	3 (1,507	(1,241,384	59,276	\$ 1,870,033	(1,277)	9,238,332

ELECTRIC					Post Settle	ement			
			2012 Pl	an			2013	Plan	
Program	Product	Participants	Budget	kW Savings	kWh Savings	Participants	Budget	kW Savings	kWh Savings
Business	Compressed Air Efficiency	73	\$ 838,191	620	4,137,552	73	\$ 888,648	620	4,137,55
	Computer Efficiency	2,666	\$ 500,637	1,004	7,342,230	2,816	\$ 564,924	1,074	7,849,37
	Cooling Efficiency	301	\$ 2,976,091	2,121	7,033,292	304	\$ 3,125,756	2,131	7,466,28
	Custom Efficiency	34	\$ 1,903,248	717	7,607,232	38	\$ 2,044,473	825	8,748,31
	Data Center Efficiency	12	\$ 935,135	506	6,410,823	18	\$ 1,166,224	755	9,138,38
	Energy Management Systems	56	\$ 1,541,500	243	8,495,894	62	\$ 1,657,636	269	9,406,16
	Heating Efficiency	-	\$ -	-	-	-	\$ -	-	-
	Lighting Efficiency	1,140	\$ 8,388,395	12,040	62,917,758	981	\$ 8,530,227	10,880	58,957,95
	Motor & Drive Efficiency	1,589	\$ 5,433,060	3,458	21,145,535	1,924	\$ 5,883,811	3,860	23,994,12
	New Construction	91	\$ 6,385,394	8,147	24,457,692	74	\$ 7,299,374	9,808	24,790,16
	Process Efficiency	12	\$ 2,017,096	782	11,029,631	15	\$ 2,569,383	1,228	17,332,27
	Recommissioning	85	\$ 1,319,172	330	5,925,060	84	\$ 1,227,650	328	5,868,65
	Segment Efficiency	60	\$ 1,185,732	347	2,585,240	73	\$ 1,269,669	554	4,164,25
	Self-Directed Custom Efficiency	13	\$ 1,908,790	1,957	8,975,070	13	\$ 1,914,342	1,957	8,975,07
	Small Business Lighting	165	\$ 3,011,058	2,108	11,328,366	195	\$ 3,938,056	2,609	14,373,89
	Standard Offer	12	\$ 1,668,234	1,287	9,138,595	12	\$ 1,636,288	1,287	9,138,59
Business Program Total	Construction to terms	6,309	\$ 40,011,734	35,667	198,529,968	6,682	\$ 43,716,462	38,184	214,341,07
Residential	Consumer Electronics (NEW)								
	ENERGY STAR New Homes	2,580	\$ 532,721	89	1,543,624	2,629	\$ 548,054	97	1,615,42
	Evaporative Cooling Rebates	4,298	\$ 2,282,325	6,042	3,771,471	4,630	\$ 2,515,410	6,550	4,086,15
	Heating System Rebates	-	\$ -	-	-	-	\$ -	-	-
	High Efficiency Air Conditioning	2,010	\$ 2,405,385	2,871	2,372,400	2,010	\$ 2,415,130	2,871	2,372,40
	Home Lighting & Recycling	522,500	\$ 5,440,714	10,167	90,786,179	535,000	\$ 5,549,253	9,180	82,827,17
	Home Performance with ENERGY STAR	200	\$ 285,591	295	307,243	300	\$ 328,344	442	451,62
	Insulation Rebate	3,120	\$ 115,505	540	428,993	3,120	\$ 115,505	540	428,99
	Refrigerator Recycling	4,250	\$ 1,442,459	419	4,274,406	8,600	\$ 1,790,121	620	5,561,04
	School Education Kits	30,000	\$ 1,538,568	535	5,809,487	30,000	\$ 1,538,732	422	4,528,66
	Showerheads	2,631	\$ 61,600	-	466,836	2,361	\$ 61,600		466,83
	Water Heater Rebate	200	\$ 100,100	59	517,787	200	\$ 100,100	59	517,78
Residential Program Total		571,789	\$ 14,204,968	21,018	110,278,427	588,850	\$ 14,962,250	20,781	102,856,10
Load Management	Residential Saver's Switch	19,500	\$ 13,326,964	20,865	697,183	19,500	\$ 14,075,362	20,865	697,18
Load Management Total	F	19,500	\$ 13,326,964	20,865	697,183	19,500	\$ 14,075,362	20,865	697,18
Low Income	Energy Savings Kit	10,000	\$ 647,664	301	5,195,061	8,250	\$ 510,957	194	3,497,33
	Multi-Family Weatherization	12		96	1,100,000	12	\$ 389,446	112	1,283,33
	Non-Profit Energy Efficiency	25	\$ 572,599	282	1,003,630	25	\$ 930,248	506	1,800,23
I I Tatal	Single-Family Weatherization	2,860	\$ 1,236,688	384	3,942,250	2,860 <b>11,147</b>	\$ 1,254,478	356	3,645,25
Low Income Total	Dusiness Francis Analysis	12,897	\$ 2,807,620	1,063	11,240,941		\$ 3,085,129	1,169	10,226,16
Indirect Products & Services	Business Energy Analysis	400	\$ 992,648	-	-	400	\$ 1,029,449	-	-
	Consumer Education - Business	1,385	\$ 153,765	-	-	1,385	\$ 153,765	-	-
	Consumer Education - Residential	34,000	\$ 1,232,674	-	-	34,000	\$ 1,232,674	-	-
Indiana Banda da O Carabana Ta	Residential Home Energy Audit	2,175	\$ 635,574	-	-	2,175	\$ 581,677	-	-
Indirect Products & Services To		37,960	\$ 3,014,661	-	-	37,960	\$ 2,997,565	-	-
Planning & Research	DSM Planning & Administration		\$ 287,559				\$ 305,838		
	Program Evaluations & M&V		\$ 584,312				\$ 596,873		
			\$ 78,097				\$ 102,223		
	DSM Bradust Personner		\$ 274,912				\$ 263,011		
	DSM Product Development		\$ 1,022,558			465.55	\$ 1,031,536		4=
	Energy Feedback Pilot		\$ 379,400			100,000	\$ 861,048		17,121,64
	In-Home Smart Device Pilot		\$ 1,240,597				\$ 983,906		
	Electric Vehicle Charging Station Pilot		\$ 20,000				\$ 20,000		
	Building Code Support (NEW)		† .				\$ -		
	EE Financing (NEW)		\$ -				\$ -		
	ES Benchmarking Pilot (NEW)		\$ - \$ -				\$ -		
Duadust Davidanmant Cultural	Solar Thermal				0.500.00	460.00	\$ -		47.00
Product Development Subtotal		50,600	\$ 2,662,555	684	8,560,821	100,000	\$ 2,896,489	-	17,121,64
Planning & Research Total		50,600	\$ 3,887,436	70 207	8,560,821	100,000	\$ 4,164,434	- 90,000	17,121,64
PORTFOLIO SUBTOTAL		699,056	\$ 77,253,382	79,297	329,307,341	764,139	\$ 83,001,202	80,999	345,242,16
Broduct Douglanment Fort									
Product Development - Future	Unidentified								
Product Development - Future	Unidentified								
Product Development - Future  ISOC / EnerNOC Incremental	Unidentified	-	31,495	16,200		-	32,581	1,300	

Appendix A Decision No. R11-1326 Docket No. 11A-631EG Page 38 of 40

GAS		As Filed							Settlement Impact								
		2012 Plan 2013 Plan						2012 Plan 2013 Plan									
Program	Product	Participants	Budget	Dth Savings	Participants	Budget	Dth Savings	Pa	articipants	Budget	dth Savings	Participants	Budget	dth Savings			
Business	Compressed Air Efficiency	-	\$ -	-	-	\$ -	-										
	Computer Efficiency	-	\$ -	-		\$ -	-										
	Cooling Efficiency	-	\$ -	-		\$ -	-										
	Custom Efficiency	5	\$ 221,520	6,294	5	\$ 232,361	6,778										
	Data Center Efficiency	-	\$ -	-	-	\$ -	-										
	Energy Management Systems	16		2,889	17		3,069										
	Heating Efficiency	208	\$ 743,394	30,885	208	\$ 746,839	30,885										
	Lighting Efficiency	-	\$ -	-	-	\$ -	-										
	Motor & Drive Efficiency	-	\$ -	-	-	\$ -	-										
	New Construction	45	\$ 522,920	58,037	31	\$ 388,165	48,501										
	Process Efficiency	-	\$ -	-	-	\$ -	-										
	Recommissioning	8	\$ 51,333	2,261	8	\$ 48,047	2,261										
	Segment Efficiency	9	\$ 20,241	2,171	9	\$ 22,540	2,171										
	Self-Directed Custom Efficiency	-	\$ -	-	-	\$ -	-										
	Small Business Lighting	-	\$ -	-	-	\$ -	-										
	Standard Offer	6	\$ 30,036	1,754	6	\$ 30,578	1,754										
Business Program Total		297	\$ 1,627,048	104,291	284	\$ 1,506,725	95,419		-	\$ -	-	-	\$ -	-			
Residential	ENERGY STAR New Homes	2,580	\$ 2,591,808	72,521	2,629	\$ 2,638,304	73,357										
	Evaporative Cooling Rebates	-	\$ -	-	-	\$ -	-										
<u> </u>	Heating System Rebates	6,500	\$ 944,327	53,514	6,500	\$ 945,667	53,514										
	High Efficiency Air Conditioning	-	\$ -	-	-	\$ -	-										
	Home Lighting & Recycling	-	\$ -	-	-	\$ -	-										
	Home Performance with ENERGY STAR	200	\$ 250,814	7,770	300	\$ 326,542	11,672			\$ 17,250							
	Insulation Rebate	8,000	\$ 1,435,679	81,533	8,000	\$ 1,437,066	81,533			\$ 134,000			\$ 134,000	)			
	Refrigerator Recycling	-	\$ -	-	-	\$ -	-										
	School Education Kits	-	\$ -	-	-	\$ -	-										
	Showerheads	-	\$ -	-	-	\$ -	-		21,286	\$ 225,000	18,125	21,286	\$ 225,000	18,125			
	Water Heater Rebate	3,070	\$ 341,828	11,816	2,970	\$ 342,428	12,088										
Residential Program Total		20,350	\$ 5,564,456	227,154	20,399	\$ 5,690,007	232,164		21,286	\$ 376,250	18,125	21,286	\$ 359,000	18,125			
Load Management	Residential Saver's Switch	-	\$ -	-	-	\$ -	-										
Load Management Total			\$ -	-	-	\$ -	-		-	\$ -	-	-	\$ -	-			
Low Income	Energy Savings Kit	9,998	\$ 466,944	16,476	8,249	\$ 494,467	13,593										
	Multi-Family Weatherization	12	\$ 438,503	6,788	12	\$ 439,248	6,788										
	Non-Profit Energy Efficiency	25	\$ 628,006	6,970	25	\$ 628,334	6,970										
	Single-Family Weatherization	1,627	\$ 1,947,969	28,034	1,627	\$ 1,960,019			203	\$ 220,000	3,458	203	\$ 220,000	3,458			
Low Income Total	,	11,662	\$ 3,481,422	58,268	9,913	\$ 3,522,068	55,385		203	\$ 220,000	3,458	203	\$ 220,000	3,458			
Indirect Products & Services	Business Energy Analysis	100				\$ 161,658				· · · · · ·			,				
	Consumer Education - Business	593				\$ 50,002											
	Consumer Education - Residential	34,000	\$ 250,557		34,000	\$ 250,557											
	Residential Home Energy Audit	2,400	\$ 517,030		2,400	\$ 522,618											
Indirect Products & Services To	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	37,093	\$ 976,771		37,093	\$ 984,835			_	\$ -	_	_	\$ -	_			
Planning & Research	DSM Planning & Administration	11,130	\$ 103,538		,	\$ 117,300											
<b>5</b>	Program Evaluations & M&V		\$ 268,636			\$ 293,032											
	DSM Market Research	1	\$ 258,736			\$ 246,028											
	DSM Product Development	1	\$ 246,619			\$ 255,106											
	Energy Feedback Pilot	50,000	\$ 94,856	23,758	50,000	\$ 90,260											
	In-Home Smart Device Pilot	-	\$ -	23,730	-	\$ 50,200	23,738										
	Electric Vehicle Charging Station Pilot	-	\$ -	-		\$ -	-										
	Building Code Support (NEW) (PSCo EDA)	-	\$ -	-		\$ -	-										
	EE Financing (NEW)	-	\$ -	-		\$ - \$ -	-										
	Solar Thermal	-	- ب	-	-	· -	<del>                                     </del>										
Product Development Subtota		50,000	\$ 341,475	23,758	50,000	\$ 245.266	23,758		_	\$ -			\$ -				
Planning & Research Total	1	50,000		23,758	50,000	\$ 345,366 \$ 1,001,726				\$ -	-	-	\$ -	-			
i iuiiiiiig ox Neseditii ittidi	<b>L</b>	50,000	9/2,385 ب	23,/58	30,000	1,001,726 ب	23,738		•	٠ -		-	٠ -				

GAS		Post Settlement											
		2012 Plan 2013 Plan											
Program	Product	Participants	S	Budget	dth Savings	Participants	Budget	dth Savings					
Business	Compressed Air Efficiency	-	\$	-	-	-	\$ -	-					
	Computer Efficiency	-	\$	-	-	-	\$ -	-					
	Cooling Efficiency	-	\$	-	-	-	\$ -	-					
	Custom Efficiency	5	\$	221,520	6,294	5	\$ 232,361	6,778					
	Data Center Efficiency	-	\$	-	-	-	\$ -	-					
	Energy Management Systems	16	\$	37,604	2,889	17	\$ 38,195	3,069					
	Heating Efficiency	208	\$	743,394	30,885	208	\$ 746,839	30,885					
	Lighting Efficiency	-	\$	-	-	-	\$ -	-					
	Motor & Drive Efficiency	-	\$	-	-	-	\$ -	-					
	New Construction	45	\$	522,920	58,037	31	\$ 388,165	48,501					
	Process Efficiency	-	\$	-	-	-	\$ -	-					
	Recommissioning	8	\$	51,333	2,261	8	\$ 48,047	2,261					
	Segment Efficiency	9	\$	20,241	2,171	9	\$ 22,540	2,171					
	Self-Directed Custom Efficiency	-	\$	-	-	-	\$ -	-					
	Small Business Lighting		\$	_	-	_	\$ -	-					
	Standard Offer	6	\$	30,036	1,754	6	\$ 30,578	1,754					
Business Program Total		297	\$	1,627,048	104,291	284	\$ 1,506,725	95,419					
Residential	ENERGY STAR New Homes	2,580	\$	2,591,808	72,521	2,629	\$ 2,638,304	73,357					
residentia	Evaporative Cooling Rebates	-	\$	2,551,666	-	-	\$ -	-					
	Heating System Rebates	6,500	\$	944,327	53,514	6,500	\$ 945,667	53,514					
	High Efficiency Air Conditioning	-	\$	-	-	-	\$ -	-					
	Home Lighting & Recycling		\$		-	_	\$ -	_					
	Home Performance with ENERGY STAR	200	\$	268,064	7,770	300	\$ 326,542	11,672					
	Insulation Rebate	8,000	\$	1,569,679	81,533	8,000	\$ 1,571,066	81,533					
	Refrigerator Recycling	8,000	\$	1,303,073	81,333	8,000	\$ 1,371,000	01,333					
	School Education Kits	-	\$		-	-	\$ -	-					
	Showerheads	21,286	\$	225,000	18,125	21,286		18,125					
	Water Heater Rebate	3,070	\$	341,828	11,816	2,970	\$ 342,428	12,088					
Residential Program Total	Water fielder Rebate	41,636	\$	5,940,706	245,279	41,685	\$ 6,049,007	250,289					
Load Management	Residential Saver's Switch	41,030	\$	3,540,700	243,273		\$ -	230,283					
Load Management Total	Residential Saver's Switch	-	\$		_	_	\$ -	-					
•	Energy Sovings Kit	9,998	\$					42.502					
Low Income	Energy Savings Kit		_	466,944	16,476	8,249		13,593					
	Multi-Family Weatherization	12	\$	438,503	6,788	12	·	6,788					
	Non-Profit Energy Efficiency	25	\$	628,006	6,970	25	\$ 628,334	6,970					
I am Incomo Tatal	Single-Family Weatherization	1,830	\$	2,167,969	31,492	1,830	\$ 2,180,019	31,492					
Low Income Total	D. dans France Andrew	11,865	_	3,701,422	61,726	10,116	\$ 3,742,068	58,843					
Indirect Products & Services	Business Energy Analysis	100	\$	159,182	0		\$ 161,658	0					
	Consumer Education - Business	593	\$	50,002	0		\$ 50,002	0					
	Consumer Education - Residential	34,000	_	250,557	0			0					
	Residential Home Energy Audit	2,400	_	517,030	0		\$ 522,618	0					
Indirect Products & Services 1		37,093	\$	976,771	-	37,093	\$ 984,835	•					
Planning & Research	DSM Planning & Administration	0	Y	103,538	0			0					
	Program Evaluations & M&V	0	\$	268,636	0	0	\$ 293,032	0					
		0	\$	-	0	0	\$ -	0					
	DSM Market Research		\$	258,736	0		\$ 246,028	0					
	DSM Product Development		\$	246,619	0		\$ 255,106	0					
	Energy Feedback Pilot	50,000	_	94,856	23,758	50,000		23,758					
	In-Home Smart Device Pilot		\$	-	0		\$ -	C					
	Electric Vehicle Charging Station Pilot		\$	-	0			C					
	Building Code Support (NEW) (PSCo EDA)		\$	-	-	0		-					
	EE Financing (NEW)		\$	-	-	0	\$ -	-					
	Solar Thermal	C	\$		0	\$ -	\$ -	(					
Product Development Subtot	al	50,000	\$	341,475	23,758	50,000	\$ 345,366	23,758					
Planning & Research Total		50,000	\$	972,385	23,758.00	50,000	\$ 1,001,726	23,758					
PORTFOLIO TOTAL	<u> </u>	140,891		13,218,332	435,054	139,178	\$ 13,284,361	428,309					

Appendix A Decision No. R11-1326 Docket No. 11A-631EG Page 40 of 40